Page 5919

Room 1018 East Building Phone: 772-4200

## **MINUTES**

## Meeting of the Hunter College Senate 24 February 2016

The 581<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Hunter College Senate was convened at 3:39 PM in HW room 714.

**Presiding:**4

Attendance:

Sandra Clarkson, Chair

1 2

The elected members of the Senate with the exception of those marked absent in Appendix I.

Alternate Senators were formally seated in accordance with the procedures approved by the Senate, and clickers were distributed to them.

**Meeting Minutes:** Meeting Minutes of December 9th were approved as distributed.

Report by the Administrative Committee:

Professor Clarkson reported that there would be no report from the President this week as she is currently traveling. She introduced Robert Pignatello the Acting Vice President for Administration who joined the Hunter Community three weeks ago.

Acting Vice President Pignatello said the following:

"I just wanted to say how delighted I am to join the leadership team here at Hunter College. I have been very busy learning about the college, talking with my staff, and visiting units located elsewhere. I have been so impressed with the quality of the faculty, students, and staff here. Before I continue, I wanted to tell everyone a little bit more about me. I have been a part of CUNY for twenty-two years. All of my time was at John Jay College as the Vice President for Administration. My portfolio there is similar to what I have now. The only new unit I have is Continuing Education, which I look forward to working with. I will be advocating with Central Administration to make sure Hunter gets more than its fair share with resources. My job really is to be a sound steward in getting resources and assets for faculty, students, and staff. I did a lot at John Jay with engagement with faculty, students, and staff and will continue to do so here at Hunter.

In terms of finances, we are living in tough times at CUNY with the state of our budget and the continued reliance on tuition to keep afloat. I am concerned about this and what this coming year is going to look like. I am going to be talking with the President and others about this, as the State and City are currently at odds on the funding for CUNY for the coming year. I look forward to being a member of this body as I have served on the College Council at John Jay and I look forward to doing great things with you all here at Hunter."

### a) Approved Curriculum Changes

The following curriculum changes as listed in the attached Report dated 24 February 2016 have been approved as per Senate resolution and are submitted for the Senate's information. Items: US-2042 School of Social Work (New courses), US-2039 Women & Gender Studies (New Courses; Add to P&D/C and D, and InS), US-2040 Women & Gender Studies (Change in course; Add to P&D/C), US-2041 German (New Courses; Add to P&D/C), US-2043 Economics (Change in course), US-2045 Economics (Change in degree program), US-2044 Asian American Studies (New course; Add to P&D/B, "W", and HCR/CrE), US-2046 Classical & Oriental Studies/Japanese (New Course), US-2051 Classical & Oriental Studies/Japanese (New Minor), US-2052 Classical & Oriental Studies/Japanese (New Minor), US-2047 Classical & Oriental Studies/Classics (Change in courses), US-2048 Classical & Oriental Studies/Classics (New course), US-2049 Dance (Change in courses), US-2050 Dance (New course), and UR-2054 Biology (Change in courses).

Minutes Page 5920

## Meeting of the Hunter College Senate

**24 February 2016** 

## b) Update Regarding Action Impacting Hunter's School of Urban Public Health

Professor Clarkson said the following:

"You have a news bulleting and this was sent out in advance. At the last senate meeting was passed a resolution against the procedures used by CUNY to take away our Public Health Programs and Degrees. Right after the meeting I sent copies of the resolution to the Chancellor, Provost, and Board of Trustees members. I did not heard back from any of them but did get a response from the lawyer. The communication between him and I have been provided for you in the bulletin. The last email I sent out was to the New York State Board of Regents and Commissioner of Education. I have not herd back from them either. One good thing that has happened was that we have been told that we will get back our Nutrition MS degree, but since they have already done away with our courses and degrees, we have to wait for them to be reinstated. Students who are scheduled to graduate this spring with MPH degrees will be Hunter graduates.

# Report by the Vice President of Student Affairs:

### Report Regarding the Behavioral Response Team (BRT)

Members of the Behavioral Response Team gave a PowerPoint presentation on their activities and objectives, and took questions from the body.

The presentation is in Appendix II.

## Committee Reports:

## Report by the Committee on Academic Freedom:

Professor Sarah Chinn, Chair of the Committee, reported on a change to the charge of the Committee Academic Freedom:

"The committee is bringing two pieces of business to the body today. The first is a revision of our charge, which I hope will be fairly uncontroversial. This is located in the packet that was handed out at the door. As you can see in the procedures we are creating a subcommittee that will review complaints. The members would be chosen by the chair of the committee."

It was moved and seconded that a typo be fixed to include a after and in the resolution. This was accepted with consent from the body.

### From:

In order to secure and a ensure protected environment for individuals who wish to bring cases of abridgement of academic freedom before the committee, such charges will be examined by a sub-committee of two members chosen by the complainant or, if requested, by the committee chair.

To:

In order to secure and ensure a protected environment for individuals who wish to bring cases of abridgement of academic freedom before the committee, such charges will be examined by a sub-committee of two members chosen by the committee chair in consultation with the complainant and the rest of the committee.

Acting Provost Kaufman moved that the following sentence be added at the end of the paragraph:

In order to secure and a ensure protected environment for individuals who wish to bring cases of abridgement of academic freedom before the committee, such charges will be examined by a subcommittee of two members chosen by the committee chair in consultation with the complainant and the rest of the committee. *In addition, the committee chair shall be recused from serving on the subcommittee.* 

The question was called and carried on the amendment.

111 **Minutes** 5921 **Page** Meeting of the Hunter College Senate 112 113 **24 February 2016** 114 115 Voting by clickers produced the following 54 for, 3 opposed, and 4 abstentions. The amendment 116 carried. 117 118 The question was called and carried. Motion to approve the change as modified produced the 119 following results: 59 for, 1 opposed, and 1 abstention. The change, as modified, carried. 120 121 Professor Chinn presented the second piece of business, a resolution: 122 123 **Revised Mission Statement for the Hunter College** 124 **Standing Committee on Academic Freedom** For committee discussion November 17, 2015 125 126 Academic freedom extends to all curricular units at Hunter College. At its core, this 127 128 freedom protects faculty, other instructional staff, and students to engage in open inquiry 129 and expression both inside and outside the College without undue influence, or fear of adverse action. For faculty both individually and in the context of shared governance, it 130 comprises the freedom, based on expertise in the field, to design and implement 131 curriculum and evaluate colleagues within the structures elaborated by the CUNY 132 133 Bylaws and the Hunter College Senate. For instructors, both part-time and full-time, it 134 consists in teaching, evaluation of students, research, creative activity, and publication 135 within their areas of expertise, as well as the freedom to speak extramurally. Academic 136 freedom is of paramount importance in the realms of reappointment, tenure, and promotion. For students, academic freedom consists in the ability to be free within the 137 classroom, laboratory, and other College spaces, to express the widest range of 138 viewpoints in accord with the standards of scholarly inquiry. 139 140 The charge of the Hunter College Senate Standing Committee on Academic Freedom 141 142 includes: 143 To monitor, examine, and report annually to the Senate on the status of academic freedom at the College; 144 145 To make appropriate recommendations regarding academic freedom policies and 146 practices to the college's governance bodies and, as appropriate, through those 147 bodies to the University Faculty Senate; 148 To investigate possible violations of academic freedom. 149 Structurally, investigations into academic freedom complaints neither replace nor serve 150 as an alternative to pre-existing grievance or appeals procedures, including but not limited to the functions of Ombuds officer, departmental appeals, collective bargaining, 151 152 and complaints handled by the Dean of Diversity and Compliance. 153 Concerns from the Provost and General Counsel about the mission statement conflicting with the 154 155 Charter were raised. The revised statement says academic freedom extends to faculty, staff, and 156 students whereas the charter says academic freedom extend to ALL members of the Hunter 157 College Community. 158 159 A motion to call to question was made and seconded. 160 161 A point of order was made and the Parliamentarian was asked on whether this change violates the Charter. After a lengthy debate and discussion on this matter Chair Clarkson ruled that the 162 163 Committee on Academic Freedom Mission Statement be returned to committee to be revised as 164 not to conflict with current language in the Charter. 165 166

Minutes Page 5922

Meeting of the Hunter College Senate

**24 February 2016** 

### **Committee on Charter Review:**

Professor Thomas DeGloma, Chair of the Committee, said the following:

"I am reporting today on behalf of the committee. I would like to thank all committee members for their work over the course of the year. Some may remember from last year that the process to revise the Charter is quite tedious, and certain steps have to be followed to amend it. There are many areas that are currently outdated regarding language and procedures and policies of the college.

I am here in an early effort to give you an idea of what is ahead for the rest of the semester. The schedule ahead is that on March 9th, we will share all of the materials that we will bring you on March 30th when we will present the First Reading of Proposed Changes. The purpose of this is to get you the revisions ahead of time where you can review and reach out to me or the Committee on the proposed changes, and any problems can be addressed ahead of the March 30th reading. On May 4th, the Second Reading of Proposed Amendments will take place. The new Senate on May 18th will vote on the Third Reading and changes.

I would like to discuss our approach to this for the year. The committee decided to prioritize the changes that we would like to make this academic year, and not all will be able to be done this year. We chose four items that we will bring to you in resolution form to have a debate and discussion on changes before we go ahead with the amendment process. The first change involves percentages for representation for full-time faculty. Full-time lecturers are currently in the 13 percent category that is slated for part time representation, and we would like to move full-time lecturers to the 44 percent category where other full time faculty are represented. The next resolution will make it possible for distinguished lecturers and clinical professors to hold spots under the 13 percent reserved for part-time faculty. The third resolution is on graduate student representation. We are concerned with increasing participation of students on the Senate. I have been in touch with members of both the undergraduate and graduate student associations. The graduate student representatives have expressed interest in being able to choose their representatives on this body. They were unaware that they could come to this body and express concerns that they are currently facing. This resolution will allow them to have a say on who represents them but include provisions that if they fail to do so, the Senate can appoint students according to procedures we currently have. Hopefully, this works, and we can extend this to the undergraduate student government. The fourth change is regarding the Ombudsman Officer, and it will be evident to the reason when you see the materials on March 9th

Other issues that we do not take up this year will be comprised into a chairs report that I will present to the body at the end of the year, and a future iteration of the committee can take up.

The other document we will present includes various routine changes that have been made by this body or the CUNY Board of Trustees on language that needs to be updated. For example, we have created and replaced department and programs, and this needs to be addressed. We will call this document a housekeeping item."

**Old Business:** 

Professor Bernadette McCauley spoke on the FDA's last meeting which was on the COACHE Survey. Two guest speakers from John Jay College came to speak on how they used the survey to make changes at their institution and presented some best practices. The FDA assembled a small task force that will come up with two or three areas based on the survey. If anyone would like to join please contact her or another member of the FDA.

**New Business:** 

Professor Bernadette McCauley reported on the FDA's concern with the faculty hiring practices at the college. A fact finding committee was assembled and they have issued a report that has been given to the Senate to be read into the minutes and it can also be viewed from the FDA website. At the next meeting the FDA is bringing a resolution asking the Senate to take action on this. The report is in Appendix III.

191

192

193

168

169

170

171

172

173174

175

176

177

178

179 180

181 182

183

184

185

186

200

201

207208209210

211

212

213214215

216

217218219

220221222

223224225

Minutes Page **Meeting of the Hunter College Senate 24 February 2016** Professor Elke Nicolai asked who the Hunter College representatives are on the CUNY Faculty Advisory Board. Acting Provost Kaufman responded that one administrator and one faculty member have been appointed. Philip Alcabes is the Administrative Representative and Gary Mallon from the School of Social Work is the Faculty Representative. Due to the late hour it was moved that the meeting be adjourned. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 5:20PM. Respectfully submitted, Thomas DeGloma Secretary

# Meeting of the Hunter College Senate 24 February 2016

## APPENDIX I

Faculty						
AFPRL	Anthony Browne		A	Mathematics & Statistics	Sandra Clarkson	
	Denis Milagros	(A)	X		Verna Segarra	
	Edgardo Melendez	(A)	X		Pat Burke	(.
Anthropology	Jackie Brown	()	A		Rob Thompson	(
	Mike Steiper	(A)		Medial Laboratory Sciences	Hongxing Li	`
	Wike Stelper	(A)	21	Wedian Eaboratory Sciences	Robert Raffaniello	(
Art & Art History	Harper Montgomery	(A)	X		Dean Johnston	(
Art & Art History	Carrie Moyer		X	Music		,
	•	(4)		Wusic	Jewel Thompson	,
	Daniel Bozhkov	(A)			Maura Donahue	(
D. 1 . 10 .	Nebahat Avcioglu	(A)		C.I. I. CNI.	Michele Cabrini	(
Biological Sciences	Derrick Brazill		A	School of Nursing	David Keepnews	
	Shirley Raps		X		Christine Anne Ganzer	
	Paul Feinstein	(A)			Abigail Kotowski	(
	Maria Pereira	(A)	X		Lynda Olender	(
Chemistry	Akira Kawamura		A	Philosophy	Justin Garson	
	Gabriela Smeureanu	(A)	A		Omar Dahbour	(
		(A)			Laura Keating	(
Classical & Oriental Studies	Joanne Spurza		Α	Physics & Astronomy	Marilyn Rothschild	
	Larry Kowerski	(A)	Е	,	Ying Chen	
	•	(A)			Kelle Cruz	(
Computer Science	Lei Xie	` '	X	Political Science	Rachel Schutte	
	Felisa Vasquez-Abad	(A)			Jill Schwedler	
	rensa vasquez ribad	(A)	71		3111 Selfwedier	·
Cumianhum & Tasakina	Lody Dollask	(A)	X	Davishalası	Roseanne Flores	,
Curriculum & Teaching	Jody Polleck			Psychology		
	Jason Wirtz	(4)	A		Joseph Lao	
	Stephen Demeo	(A)			Peter Serrano	
	Ben Shuldiner	(A)			Peter Moller	(
Economics	Timothy Goodspeed		X	Phy sical Therapy	Herb Karpatkin	
					Tom Holland	(
	Avi Liveson	(A)	X			
	John Li	(A)	X	Romance Languages	Julie Van Peteghem	
Educational Foundations & Co	oui Veronica Muller		A		Rolando Perez	
	Alexander Fietzer	(A)	X		Monica Schinaider	
	John Keegan	(A)	X	School of Social Work	Terry Mizrahi	
English	Leigh Jones		X			
	Sarah Chinn		A		Samuel Aymer	
	Steven Wetta	(A)	A			
	John Keegan	(A)		Sociology	Mark Halling	
Film & Media Studies	Bill Herman	()	X	a	Mike Benediktsson	
1 mil & Wedia Stadies	Ricardo Miranda		X		Wike Benediktsson	
	Joseph McElhaney	(A)		Special Education	Elizabeth Klein	,
	•	(A)		Special Education	Jennifer Klein	
C	Larry Shore	(A)				
Geography	Hay dee Salmun	(4)	X		Kristen Hodnett	
	Jochen Albrecht	(A)		Speech-Language Pathology and Au		
_	Carsten Kessler	(A)			Donald Vogel	
German	Elke Nicolai		A			0 (
	Eckhard Kuhn-Osius	(A)		Theatre	Jonathan Kalb	
		(A)			Louisa Thompson	(
History	Rick Belsky		A			(
	Manu Bhagavan	(A)	X	Urban Affairs	Jill Simone Gross	
	Eldor Mehilli		A			
Library	Mee' Len Hom		A			
<del>-</del>	Sarah Ward		X	School of Urban Public Health	Franklin Mirer	
	Adina Mulliken	(A)				
	Danise Hoover	(A)		Women & Gender Studies	Jennifer Gaboury	
		(11)	••	omen ee conder brudes	Rupal Oza	
					Nupa Oza	

Minutes	Page	5925
Meeting of the Hunter College Senate		
24 February 2016		

24 February 2016					
		At-Large, Lecturers and Part-Time Faculty			
Students		Student Services	Shannon Salinas	A	
Denise Bolognino	X		Brian Maasjo	(A) A	
Maria Pia Sifuentes	A	Mathematics & Statistics	Bill Williams	E	
Abdul Rad	A	Sociology	Thomas DeGloma	A	
		Library	Jocelyn Berger-Barrera	A	
Stephanie Barragan	A	English	Jeff Allred	X	
Albiona Aga	A	ТННР	Sarah Jeninsky	A	
Christine Hirt	A	Mathematics & Statistics	Barbara Barone	E	
		Classical & Oriental Studies	Elizabeth Beaujour	X	
Stephen Acaza	A	Music	Brad Stoller	X	
Jonathan Ayala	X	Urban Affairs & Planning	Elaine Walsh	A	
		Urban Affairs & Planning	Laxmi Ramasubramanian	A	
		History	Bernadette McCauley	A	
		SEEK	Sunday Coward	X	
Jonah Garnick	A				
		Ex-Officio			
		President, USG	Chika Onyejiukwa	X	
		Vice President, Graduate Student Associat	tic Kelly Homenick	X	
		President Alumni Association	Patricia Rudden	A	
		President, HEO Forum	Dana Reimer	X	
	X	President, CLT Council	Amy Jeu	A	
	A				
		ADMINISTRATION			
		Senators:			
		HEO/CLA Representative	Mary lin Daley-Weston	A	
		Vice President for Student Affairs	Eija Ayravainen	A	
		Vice President for Administration	Robert Pignatello	A	
		Provost, Acting	Lon Kaufman	A	
		Dean, School of Arts & Sciences	Andrew Polsky	A	
Tamzeed Rahman	X	Alternate Senators (3):			
		Dean of Education, Acting	Jennifer Tuten	X	
Ashley Wong	X	Special Counsel to the President & Dea	n Laura Hertzog	A	
		School of Nursing	Dean Gail McCain	A	
		TEMPORARY REALLOCATION OF SEATS (clickers)			
		Department/Program:			
Sheana Budhoo	A	Asian American Studies Program			
Stephany Garces	X	Religion	David Cerequas	X	
Joy Nuga	A	Religion	Barbara Sproul	E	
Sara Shanaj	X	-	•		
Sadal Ayaz	X				
Nayen Yisrael	X				

## APPENDIX II

# The Hunter College Behavioral Response Team

A Comprehensive, College-Wide Behavioral Intervention Model

www.hunter.cuny.edu/brt

# The Behavioral Response Team (BRT)

## **BRT's core functions:**

- Evaluation
- · Early Intervention
- Prevention



**24 February 2016** 

# Collaborative Operation of the BRT:

- Communication
- Coordination
- Intervention
- Follow-up



# Reasons for a BRT Referral

- Disruptive or threatening behavior that impacts the mission and / or standard proceedings of the College, the faculty, staff, or students
- Self-injurious behavior
- Suicidal ideation
- Other troubling behavior

5928

# What Does the BRT Do?

- Maintains a productive learning/working environment
- · Identifies (early) those students in need of assistance
- Prevents a behavioral concern from rising to the level of a threat or crisis
- Assesses and addresses distressed, disruptive, disturbed, dysregulated behavior
- Promotes a culture of mutual support and collaboration
- · Supports and provide resources to students who evidence emotional/behavioral disturbance
- Centralizes Information/Track "red flags"
- Eliminates fragmented intervention

# Be Aware!

In the event of an emergency please notify **Public Safety immediately.** 

212-772-4444

The BRT should not be used as the first-line contact in an emergency.

# **BRT Members**

BRT Chair: Eija Ayravainen, VP for Student Affairs and Dean of Students

Members: Madlyn Stokely, Assistant VP, Student Affairs, BRT Meeting

- Leslie Ader, Director, Counseling & Wellness Services
- Sharmeen Ahmed, Associate Director, Student Conduct
- · Colleen Barry, Director, Student Conduct
- · Sandi Clarkson, Representative of the Senate
- Joseph Foelsch, Director, Public Safety
- Taahira Maynard, Student Affairs Manager
- · Luis E. Roldan, Director, Residence Life

Additional Ad Hoc Members include representatives from the following departments /offices:

- Academic Departments
- Legal Affairs
- Diversity and Compliance
- AccessABILITY

# The Behavioral Response Team

212.772.4878

www.hunter.cuny.edu/brt

Minutes Meeting of the Hunter College Senate

**24 February 2016** 

### APPENDIX III

5930

Page

# Report of the Faculty Delegate Assembly Committee on Hiring Practice

### **BACKGROUND**

This committee was organized in the spring of 2015 by FDA president Bernadette McCauley acting on behalf of the FDA Executive Committee after discussion at FDA general meetings revealed faculty concerns about the circumstances surrounding several recent hires, specifically the lessening of departmental autonomy in the hiring process. Committee members included John Wallach (Political Science) as chair, Stephen DeMeo (Education) Catherine Raisiguier (Women and Gender), Louise Sherby (Library), Trudy Smoke (English) and Bernadette McCauley as ex---officio. When Professor Wallach went on leave in the fall of 2015, Bernadette McCauley took over as committee chair.

#### **PROCESS**

The committee assigned each member a group of chairs to contact individually and discuss the successes and failures in recent searches in the Schools of Arts and Science and Education; the process of the hire; interaction with the administration throughout the process. Of the 33 contacted, 15 chairs participated in the survey. Several chairs said they were not comfortable responding because of how their participation might be interpreted by the administration.

Some chairs responded in writing and others preferred to meet in person.

The committee also issued a general call to faculty to contact the committee or FDA with concerns about hiring and several faculty members did so with the promise of confidentiality.

### **FINDINGS**

Interviews with the chairs revealed that while many chairs felt that their searches had the support of the administration for the hire, they emphasized the inefficiency of the administrative involvement during the process, and elaborated on the unnecessary problems/issues that the cumbersome process creates. Most noted CUNY First has complicated the process but also identified in---house problems and their frustration in attempting to work through them. Other comments addressed specific departmental irregularities and concerns about inappropriate administrative pressure.

These included:

1) The protracted schedule of approvals and allotment of funding were two items most often noted as problematic. Chairs reported numerous hold---ups along the line as they awaited authorization to hire and approvals for ads and emphasized that the general paper work required was very slowly processed and the information was not easily available at any step within the process. As a result, searches began at a disadvantage vis---à---vis hiring at other schools, and did not allow for interviewing at scheduled professional conferences. "Always confusing when searches will actually happen" "Takes so long to get approvals from different levels: Human Resources, Affirmative

Action, budget" "When ask what is going on, no one knows" "Inefficiency at almost all levels"

1) Insufficient funding and the lag in allocation of funding were cited as issues which kept departments from bringing in candidates and creating a timely schedule. In one case a chair paid for ads so as to get them in on time. "Not enough money to bring in outside NYC area" "We do not attempt to recruit from outside New York City"

5931

Page

- 2) Many chairs expressed concern over the lack of transparency in the allocation of lines and several felt their deans were not involved in the process. "Don't ever find out why departments get lines all over campus—why is this secret?" "Retirements and resignations and no authority to replace" Most lines were replacements for retirements but not all retirement were replaced. New lines noted as difficult: "New lines are another story" Several lines were combined and some replaced as visiting lines. One chair reported a "target of opportunity" line.
- 3) Most searches were successful; several were not because candidates took another offer. Some chairs felt that good candidates were lost in the overall process because of the slowness of the hiring process. In one instance the administration went to a candidate with a lower offer after an offer had been made which, although resolved, was awkward. "Because of process here, difficult to follow up in a timely manner s lost some excellent candidates." "Hard to compete with NYU and Columbia" "Great delays which in turn created a situation where candidates would accept other offers"
- 4) Several chairs reported serious complaints about administrative involvement and influence beyond the allocation of the line: a dean re---writing a departmental ad for a job description, another dean rejecting a department's first choice for a position, administrative pressure on the direction of new hires with regard to field. "The Dean at the time heavily interfered with the process" "The Dean did not want the top ranked candidate and selected another candidate"

Faculty who individually contacted the FDA raised general issues and specific incidents in their own and other departments that they found to be serious violations of procedure. These issues included: (The comments are paraphrased.)

- 1) Faculty hires with waiver of CUNY search requirements. No one talks about them openly but we know they happen.
- 2) Instructors hired to teach specific courses teach courses at Roosevelt House and other honors programs. Who chooses these instructors and Directors? What academic status are they to have and who makes that decision? What role should departments have if they are hired with the title of Professor? Who designs and vets the courses they teach? Current procedures answer some but not all of these questions.
- 3) The role of departmental self---studies in identifying positions for new hires. How much weight do these evaluations play in a decision about a line?
- 4) Inappropriate administrative involvement. Ads rewritten without departmental permission, administrative disregard for the majority choice of a final candidate, inappropriate involvement in chair elections.
- 5) Spousal hires. Is there a college policy on this?

Respectfully submitted,

Bernadette McCauley February 17, 2016