**Office of the Hunter College Senate**
Room 1018 East Building                                                                                    Phone: 772-4200

# MINUTES
## Meeting of the Hunter College Senate
## 5 February 2014

1        The 558th meeting of the Hunter College Senate was convened at 3:40 PM in Room W714.
2
3   **Presiding:**        Christa Davis Acampora, Chair
4
5   **Attendance:**       The elected members of the Senate with the exception of those marked absent in Appendix I.
6
7                         Alternate Senators were formally seated in accordance with the procedures approved by the
8                         Senate, and clickers were distributed to them.
9
10  **Minutes:**          The minutes from November 20th and December 4th were approved as distributed.
11
12  **Report by the**     **Provost Vita Rabinowitz presented an update on the Periodic Review Report (PRR)**
13  **Provost:**          Below is a summary of what she said:
14
15                        "I am pleased to update you on the Periodic Review process. This is the 5 (five) year midterm
16                        report to the Middle States Commission on Higher Education, Hunter's major accrediting body.
17                        As a community, Hunter College is hard at work at the task in hand.
18
19                        A significant portion of the PRR will be devoted to the implementation of our Strategic Plan and
20                        the assessment of student learning outcomes and institutional effectiveness. There has been great
21                        progress on these initiatives.
22
23                        Much of this progress is organic and within unit. The work that we are doing is identifying and
24                        gathering what is out there. I believe we are profiting as a college from this process of finding,
25                        sharing, experiencing and information. Personally, it has been gratifying to see how much people
26                        want to contribute and how positively people have respond to what is going on.
27
28                        The PRR process might easily have been approached as a mere compliance task. However, our
29                        steering committee and subcommittee members have been approaching it with a combination of
30                        intellectual curiosity, a desire to be heard, and dedication to Hunter College.
31
32                        Over the Fall semester, an exceptional steering committee has met with me, our assessment team
33                        and others, to plan the major scope of the works. We met three times as a steering committee. On
34                        December 18th, 2013, we also met with a larger group that consists of the steering committee and
35                        members of five subcommittees.
36
37                        The five subcommittees are formed based on the PRR, Middle States Commission on Higher
38                        Education's (MSCHE) Standards of Excellence, Hunter's responsibility for reporting to MSCHE
39                        based on previous MSCHE'S actions, and the implementation of our own strategic plan. There are
40                        many ways that we can talk about our strategic plans. We are determined to become more research
41                        oriented and student focus institution.
42
43                        The five subcommittees that we have formed are:
44                        •   Research and Creative Activity
45                        •   Graduate and Professional Education
46                        •   General Education and its Assessment
47                        •   Assessment of Learning in the Disciplines
48                        •   Administrative Assessment and Accountability
49
50
51

55 There can be many subgroups within the subcommittees. We have outstanding chairs and leaders
56 of subcommittees. The subcommittees are guided by the central questions that the assessment
57 team generated for them.

59 To give an example of the kind of information we are gathering and hoping to share with the rest
60 of the community so that you can do or suggest your own analyses: We have gathered in one
61 place summaries of the result of various funded initiatives, such as presidential travel awards and
62 presidential awards for faculty advancement. Moreover, there are other programs that support
63 faculty and student research. We have all of the information regarding our academic's
64 departments learning outcomes in one place. We have a better understanding of retention and
65 graduation rates. We have the synthesis of the work conducted by administrative assessment
66 committee, including how administrators closing the loop after assessing their own units. Our
67 committee on Graduate and Professional Education has gathered much of the data on graduate
68 admission, enrollment, retention, graduation and time to degree by program across the college.
69 The information is being use for our discussion with President Raab about resource allocation and
70 planning for graduate and professional programs. The databases being generated are already of use
71 to the College and can be of great use to you, specifically if you are writing grant proposals and
72 need up-to-date information about the college. We will soon have all of that information ready for
73 you. We will be more responsive to you about those things as we move forward.

75 Throughout this process, we have been in consultation with other groups beside the PRR
76 subcommittee members such as the Senate Committee on General Education, the offices of the
77 President, Finance and Administration and Student Affairs. We will be working closely with the
78 Committee on Student Success. We also are looking forward to meet with other Senate
79 subcommittees.

81 I would like to give you a sense of the linkage between strategic planning, budgeting and
82 resourcing allocation. We are working closely with the Office of Finance and Administration on
83 their portion of the PRR. We have gathered the required documents for current year and our three
84 year projections. We are giving information on actual enrollment and projected enrollment. We
85 are showing the budgetary enrollment assumptions that are guiding our planning to the future. We
86 will be happy to show you that we are operating without deficit even in this era of financial
87 constraint. This fiscal prudence has continued as we realize key elements of the strategic plan.
88 This reflects well on planning and budgeting processes. If we did not have program and initiatives
89 to support our funding we will not be able to raise the money that we are raising. Again, we will
90 be reaching out to more groups, other senate committees and the upcoming Presidential task force
91 on Student Advising.

93 The PRR process is providing an opportunity for us to see what we have accomplished since 2009.
94 It also broadly expanded the number of faculty and administrators who now have access to how
95 the other colleges are doing. Therefore, we can share our best practices. Assessment at Hunter is
96 not a one shot, after the fact evaluation. It is a unit and faculty driven continuous research. It is a
97 tool to make us a better informed institution, and one that makes decisions based on evidence. It is
98 the evidence that student can use and improve their learning and the faculty can use to improve
99 their teaching and research productivity.

101 Furthermore, the evidence can also be used by the programs to improve student outcomes. We are
102 also learning a lot about assessment metrics at Hunter. The faculty, staff, and departments are
103 doing assessment surpassingly well. We will be asking these faculties, staff, and departments to
104 share their knowledge working closely with ACERT. Equally important, we are discovering gaps.
105 There are gaps in our performance and professional development so we may improve and engage
106 in more careful analysis of our performance.

114    In this process, faculty and staff can make connection among themselves and think creatively to
115    answer questions. We are talking about these questions not as an imperative and not as things we
116    have to do not simply to comply with the MSCHE but rather as interesting questions for us to
117    ponder. This assessment is a collaborative research and it is a superb foundation beyond PRR.
118    Even though PRR is undeniably time consuming, I believe it is adding value and a foundation
119    upon which we can move forward after it is over. Again, it is due June 1st, 2014. I think we are on
120    track to meet that deadline. In particular, the PRR process has helped us uncover the power of
121    assessment so we can improve what we do and it has lifted the profile of strategic plan in the
122    college. The Hunter College strategic plan that was accepted by this body in 2011 is a galvanizing
123    vision for Hunter as a first rate research-intensive student focused institution. We intend on
124    sharing the draft of the report and we look forward in discussing the finding and making the
125    database available to you.

127    Thank you."

129    **Report by the**        The Chair, Professor Christa Davis Acampora, presented the report as follows:
130    **Administrative**
131    **Committee:**           a)   **Approved Curriculum Changes**
132                                  The following curriculum changes as listed in the Report dated 5 February 2014 have been
133                                  approved as per Senate resolution and are submitted for the Senate's information:  GS-974
134                                  (Department of Physical Therapy).

136                             b)   **Resolution on Expansion of Participation in Senate Meetings**
137                                  Prof. Christa Acampora, Chair, reported on the resolution.  Below is what she said:

139                                  "This resolution comes from the Administrative Committee, and concerns the means of legal
140                                  participation in the activities and business of the Senate, as defined in our charter. While our
141                                  charter does not prohibit expanded participation, ensuring that we meet the legal demands of
142                                  the charter, we are asking the body's permission to expand opportunity for participation
143                                  beyond the 68th Street location. In particular, we are looking to make this available to the
144                                  faculty and administration at the Nursing School. As you know, they will have a complicated
145                                  physical set of challenges coming up. We understand and we appreciate their attendance here.
146                                  We are asking the body to vote to indicate that it is acceptable to participate from a remote
147                                  location other than the site of the physical meeting. We expect that we can arrange for two-
148                                  way video and audio so that we can see each other. We also expect and hope that members
149                                  sitting in the remote location will have full opportunity to participate in discussion and to
150                                  vote.

152                                  The resolution states that Senate meetings shall be open to all members of the Hunter
153                                  community at 68th Street and at designated Hunter College campus satellite locations, using
154                                  two-way video or audio connections. Senators attending meetings at satellite locations, after
155                                  following the check-in procedures, shall enjoy all of the rights and responsibilities of those
156                                  physically attending the meeting at the campus at 68th Street and Lexington Avenue,
157                                  including but not limited to: obtaining the floor, submitting motions, participating in debate
158                                  and discussion, and voting. We also hope that by making the Senate available in satellite
159                                  locations, we will increase participation among non-voting members of the faculty and
160                                  student body who might wish to be involved in the Senate affairs.

162                                  There will be opportunity for some further discussion prior to voting. We will vote on this at
163                                  the next meeting. In the meantime, the Administrative Committee welcomes other questions
164                                  and concerns that you might have. We will also continue to work with other parties in the
165                                  College regarding the technicalities and procedural details."

167                                  The resolution was read into the record.

170    **Minutes**                                                                **Page    5702**
171    **Meeting of the Hunter College Senate**
172    **5 February 2014**

173 **RESOLUTION ON EXPANSION OF PARTICIPATION IN SENATE MEETINGS**

175 **RESOLVED:** Senate meetings shall be open to all members of the Hunter community at 68th
176 Street and at designated Hunter College campus satellite locations using two-way video or
177 audio connections. Senators attending meetings at satellite locations, after following the
178 check-in procedures, shall enjoy all of the rights and responsibilities of those physically
179 attending the meeting at the campus at 68th Street and Lexington Avenue, including but not
180 limited to: obtaining the floor, submitting motions, participating in debate and discussion, and
181 voting.

183 The body will vote on the resolution at the next meeting.

185     **c)** **Student Caucus**
186     Eamon Pickard, Vice Chair, reported on the newly reestablished Student Caucus.
187     Below is a summary of what he said:

189 "This semester the student senators will be taking a lot more action to address student needs.
190 We are starting to build our agenda so that it may include certain ideas, such as balancing
191 course time. We are not looking to change things drastically. However, small things such as
192 maintenance, bathrooms, escalators, and student complaints will be discussed. We are trying
193 to get the above out of the way this semester. It would be great if we could get a student from
194 each department. Hunter College is such a diverse school. We would like to match that
195 diversity by having someone from each field. We will be mailing out flyers seeking students.
196 We still have a lot of seats available. We will also be meeting with other committees so we
197 can discuss our ideas."

199     **d)** **Reminder**
200     The first Spring 2014 News Bulletin was released. In this bulletin are the schedules for
201     submitting curriculum proposals. The Graduate Course of Study & Academic Requirements
202     Committee has scheduled its meetings in advance, as has the Undergraduate Course of Study
203     Committee. Given changes to our procedures for approving curriculum proposals, we ask that
204     you take this information back to your departments. Some of these changes include the
205     abolition of the Letter of Intent. In place of the Letter of Intent, the college will now use an
206     Advance Notice. The deadline for submitting an Advance Notice this year is April 1. The
207     news bulletin also includes a memo that was circulated to the Provost and Deans in late
208     December. We are prepared to help departments in this process and to answer any questions.
209     The news bulletin is in Appendix II.

211 **Committee**     **Committee on the General Education Requirements Appeals Committee**
212 **Report:**     Prof. Lawrence Kowerski, Chair of the Committee, reported on the newly developed online
213     application for general education appeals. Below is a summary of what he said:

215 "I am here today to report what we have been doing in the committee. With the implementation of
216 Pathways, a great deal of change has come to general education at Hunter College. We have
217 students that are working under the old requirements, GER, and we have students that are working
218 under the new requirements, HCR. All these students are still dealing with Pluralism and Diversity
219 and Foreign Language, and we also still have students working under the Distribution
220 Requirement.

222 What our committee does is handle appeals for courses taken outside or inside of Hunter to be
223 applied towards one of the various requirements. As a committee we have developed an online
224 web application for submitting appeals. This online web application is the handiwork of Jacob
225 Radford from ICIT. He has done a wonderful job in creating this. As you can see, students will be
226 able to see an appeal page and they will be able to log in using their Hunter NetID.

232 At this time, the students are doing appeals on paper. Students go to the Senate office and
233 complete the forms. With the online application, students will be able to complete the appeal on
234 any computer that is connected to the Internet. On this web application, students will be asked
235 about how they have met the objectives or learning outcomes of the course. The students will be
236 asked to attached a transcript and add a syllabus as well. If the students do not have a syllabus we
237 will work with them to gain the information. Afterwards the appeal will be submitted. The Senate
238 office will review them. Once it is reviewed, the appeal will be forwarded to the committee. The
239 committee will be running essentially online.
240
241 It will be a similar process for appeals to P&D, GER, and Foreign Language Requirements. We
242 believe that it will be much easier for the students. We will be providing them with samples so
243 they can write about course objectives.
244
245 We received a lot of student input while developing the application. It was not developed only
246 based on faculty and staff. Students have tested every possible scenario for appeals.
247
248 In addition, we have been working with many appeals. We have seen a number of HCR appeals.
249 Most of them come in the Science categories. We have seen many GER appeals where students
250 are trying to wrap things up and graduate. We also have seen quite a few appeals for the Foreign
251 Language Requirement. We have done a lot of appeals and it is quite a bit of work. It has become
252 larger than expected.
253
254 This online application is expected to be rolled out on February 10, 2014. Once we have it and it is
255 live, we will plan on how to inform students."
256
257 The application was shown on the projector. A student logged in and did a test for the Senate
258 body.
259
260 There was a concern regarding the ability for students to opt-out of the HCR. Prof. Christa
261 Acampora, Chair, explained that CUNY allows for any student to opt-out, if the student feels that
262 the CUNY Common Core may bring harm to the student's record. The discussion ended with
263 Prof. Acampora's promise to send relevant documents that support this option.
264
265 **Committee on Computing & Technology**
266 The report was postponed until the next meeting.
267
268
269 **New Business:** Prof. Sandra Clarkson announced that ACERT is hosting an open house on February 19.
270
271
272 It was moved that the meeting be adjourned. The motion carried and the meeting adjourned at 4:25
273 PM.
274
275
276 Respectfully submitted,
277
278
279
280
281 Lisa Marie Anderson
282 Secretary

**Minutes**                                                      **Page   5704**
**Meeting of the Hunter College Senate**
**5 February 2014**

# APPENDIX I

*The following attendance was noted from the meeting*          (A)=Alternate, A=Attended, X=Absent, E=Excused

**Faculty**

| Department | Name | | | Department | Name | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| AFPRL | Anthony Browne | | A | Mathematics & Statistics | Sandra Clarkson | | A |
| | Milagros Denis-Rosario | (A) | A | | Rob Thompson | | X |
| | Edgardo Melendez | (A) | X | | Verna Segarra | (A) | X |
| Anthropology | Jacqueline Nassy Brown | | X | | Patrick Burke | (A) | A |
| | Ignasi Clemente | (A) | X | Medial Laboratory Sciences | Shahana Mahajan | | A |
| | Jessica Rothman | (A) | A | | Robert Raffaniello | (A) | X |
| Art & Art History | Malik Gaines | | A | | Dean Johnston | (A) | X |
| | Daniel Bozhkov | | A | Music | Jewel Thompson | | X |
| | Alt.Susanna Cole | (A) | X | | Maura Donahue | (A) | A |
| | Harper Montgomery | (A) | X | | Catherine Coppola | (A) | A |
| Biological Sciences | Shirley Raps | | A | School of Nursing | David Keepnews | | A |
| | Paul Feinstein | | X | | | 0 | 0 |
| | Maria Figueiredo-Pereira | (A) | X | | Lorie Goshin | (A) | X |
| | Jesus Angulo | (A) | X | | Anita Nirenberg | (A) | A |
| Chemistry | Akira Kawamura | | A | Philosophy | Omar Dahbour | | A |
| | Pamela Mills | (A) | X | | Frank Kirkland | (A) | X |
| | | 0 (A) | 0 | | Laura Keating | (A) | X |
| Classical & Oriental Studies | Joanne Spurza | | X | Physics & Astronomy | Marilyn Rothschild | | X |
| | Lawrence Kowerski | (A) | A | | Kelle Cruz | (A) | X |
| | | 0 (A) | 0 | | Ying-chih Chen | (A) | X |
| Computer Science | Feliza Vasquez-Abad | | X | Political Science | Leonard Feldman | | X |
| | Saad Mneimneh | (A) | A | | Zachary Shirkey | (A) | A |
| | Virginia Teller | (A) | X | | Charles Tien | (A) | X |
| Curriculum & Teaching | Nadine A. Bryce | | A | Psychology | Joseph Lao | | E |
| | Jason Wirtz | | A | | Roseanne Flores | | A |
| | Steve Demeo | (A) | X | | Brooke Wells | (A) | X |
| | Ben Shuldiner | (A) | X | | Jason Young | (A) | X |
| Economics | Howard Chernick | | X | Physical Therapy | Herb Karpatkin | | X |
| | Avi Liveson | | X | | | 0 (A) | 0 |
| | Timothy Goodspeed | (A) | X | | | 0 (A) | 0 |
| | | 0 (A) | 0 | Romance Languages | Rolando Perez | | X |
| Educational Foundations | | 0 | 0 | | Monica Calabrito | | X |
| | | 0 (A) | 0 | | Paolo Fasoli | (A) | X |
| | | 0 (A) | 0 | | Michael Perna | (A) | A |
| English | Leigh Jones | | A | School of Social Work | Marina Lalayants | | X |
| | Sarah Chinn | | X | | | 0 | 0 |
| | Barbara Webb | (A) | X | | Mimi Abramovitz | (A) | X |
| | Stephen Wetta | (A) | X | | Ilze Earner | (A) | X |
| Film & Media Studies | Tim Portlock | | X | Sociology | Mark Halling | | X |
| | Tami Gold | | X | | Joong-Hwan Oh | (A) | X |
| | Bill Herman | (A) | A | | Mike Benediktsson | (A) | X |
| | Ricardo Miranda | (A) | A | Special Education | Angela Mouzakitis | | X |
| Geography | Haydee Salmun | | A | | Elissa Brown | (A) | X |
| | Jochen Albrecht | (A) | X | | | 0 (A) | X |
| | | 0 (A) | 0 | Speech-Language Pathology and Audiology | Susan Wortsman | | A |
| German | Lisa Marie Anderson | | A | | Don Vogel | (A) | A |
| | Eckhard Kuhn-Osius | (A) | A | | | 0 (A) | 0 |
| | Elke Nicolai | (A) | A | Theatre | Deepsikha Chatterjee | 0 | X |
| School of Health Professions | | 0 | 0 | | Mia Rovegno | (A) | A |
| | | 0 (A) | 0 | | | 0 (A) | 0 |
| History | Daniel Margocsy | | A | Urban Affairs | Jill Simone Gross | | A |
| | Richard Belsky | (A) | A | | Stanley Moses | (A) | X |
| | Thomas Head | (A) | X | | | 0 (A) | 0 |
| Library | Mee'Len Hom | | A | School of Urban Public Health | Dean Johnston | | X |
| | John Pell | (A) | A | | Lydia Isaac | (A) | X |
| | Jonathan Cain | (A) | X | | | | |

| **Students** | | | **At-Large, Lecturers and Part-Time Faculty** | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Carol Szwci | X | | Student Services | Madlyn Stokely | | A |
| Matthew Ramos | X | | | Shannon Salinas | (A) | A |
| Alexander Lemell | X | | Mathematics & Statistics | Bill Williams | | X |
| Patricia Colon | X | | Student Services | Brian Buckwald | | A |
| Mauricio Bardales | X | | Library | Jocelyn Berger-Barrera | | A |
| Abdul Rad | A | | English | Amy Robbins | | X |
| Nicole Lyalin | X | | Thomas Hunter Honors | Sarah Jeninsky | | A |
| Kidus Gebrekidan | X | | Mathematics & Statistics | Barbara Barone | | X |
| Joseph Franzese | X | | Classical & Oriental Studies | Elizabeth Beaujour | | A |
| Kascem Hewitt | X | | | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Ariela Hazan | X | | Chemistry | Gabriela Smeureanu | | A |
| Madiha Wasti | X | | | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Ibrahim Alsaygh | X | | Philosophy | Christa D. Acampora | | A |
| Julia Camila Jones | X | | | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Jason Sloan | A | | | | | |
| Wilson Chow | X | | | | | |
| Sara Shenas | X | | **Ex-Officio** | | | |
| Eamon Pickard | A | | President, USG | Steven Wendel | | X |
| Sandrea Sicango | X | | Vice President, Graduate Student Associati | Luis Gutierrez | | X |
| Shawn Rafeey | X | | President Alumni Association | Anne Seifried | | X |
| Andy Lall | X | | President, HEO Forum | Sharmeen Ahmed | | X |
| Jonah Garnick | X | | President, CLT Council | Amy Jeu | | X |
| Benedict Joson | A | | | | | |
| Nishat Tabassum | A | | | | | |
| Asad Mannan | X | | **ADMINISTRATION** | | | |
| Kevin Jackson | X | | Senators: | | | |
| Sayeda Shune | X | | HEO/CLT Representative | Lori Janowski | | X |
| Candace Lawrence | X | | Vice President for Student Affairs | Eija Ayravainen | | A |
| Barukh Rohde | E | | Chief Operating Officer | | 0 | 0 |
| Hira Gulzar | X | | Provost | Vita Rabinowitz | | A |
| Kevin Mishan | X | | Dean, School of Arts & Sciences | Andrew Polsky | | A |
| Abraham Gutman | A | | Alternate Senators (3): | | | |
| Reginald Holder | A | | School of Education | Dean David Steiner | | A |
| Javier Picayo | X | | School of Social Work | Dean Jacqueline Mondros | | A |
| Hameda Khandaker | X | | School of Nursing | Dean Gail McCain | | A |
| Zhong Linda Lin | X | | | | | |
| Ashley Wong | A | | | | | |
| Chireau White | A | | **TEMPORARY REALLOCATION OF SEATS (clickers)** | | | |
| Christopher Lai | A | | Department/Program: | | | |
| Roman Povolotskiy | A | | Asian American Studies Program | Jennifer Hayashida | | A |
| Joseph Lipari | A | | Program in Religion | David Cerequas | | X |
| | | | Women and Gender Studies Program | Jennifer Gaboury | | A |

**APPENDIX II**

# SENATE NEWS BULLETIN

Office of the Hunter College Senate                Room 1018 E
senate@hunter.cuny.edu

**NO. 1**                                                **5 February 2014**

## Critical Dates for Scheduling Curriculum Development and Implementation

Please note the following critical dates for approving and implementing major program changes. Included in the table below are schedules for the full Senate meetings and Chancellor's Report (CUR) deadlines. These are presented along with the meetings of Senate curriculum committees in order to facilitate your advance planning. Materials should be received in the Senate office in their complete and final form no later than 12 days prior to the meeting in order to appear on the agenda. Meetings may be canceled when there are no items on the agenda.

When planning your curriculum development activities, please remember that no curricular changes may be implemented until they appear in a published CUR that has been approved by the Board of Trustees. It is necessary to allow approximately four weeks for the Registrar's office to update electronic systems to reflect approved changes. Also, note that new curricular programs will take longer implement because there may be delays in their availability for students through CUNYfirst, which is now updated centrally. Given this, the April CUR, to be submitted in the last third of March, is the ultimate deadline for actions to be implemented in fall 2014. To appear in this report, items must be fully approved by the March 5 Senate meeting. Both curriculum committees will hold meetings immediately prior to that date.

The full guide to curriculum procedures is available at: http://hunter.cuny.edu/senate and further guidance is available in person at the Senate office. If you have any questions or concerns, please contact the Senate office to schedule a consultation with the chair of the relevant curriculum committee.

| 2014 Spring CURs | Senate Submission Deadlines | Senate Meetings | Undergraduate Course of Study | Graduate Course of Study & Academic Requirements |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| February | January 17th | — | — | — |
| **April*** | **March 21st** | 2/5, 2/19, **3/5** | 2/4, 2/18, 2/25, **3/4** | 1/29, **2/26** |
| June | May 16th | 3/26, 4/9, 4/23, 5/7, 5/14 | 3/18, 3/25, 4/8, 4/29, 5/6, 5/13 | 3/12, 3/19, 4/2, 4/30, |

Note: There is no March CUR.
* New programs for fall 2014 must be approved in the April Chancellor's Report in order for students to be able to register for them.

**Advance Notice** for anticipated major curricular initiatives to be developed in the 2014-2015 academic year is requested by April 1, 2014. Such initiatives include but need not be limited to:
   • New courses of study (degree programs, majors, minors, certificates)
   • New schools, institutes, centers, departments, or programs
   • Substantial changes to existing courses of study
   • Program closures